

## CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION MINUTES

DATE: DECEMBER 18, 2014

The City of Cincinnati's Civil Service Commission met in regular session in Room 307, City Hall on Thursday, December 18, 2014. Commissioners in attendance were Mr. James Robinson, Chair, Mr. Robert Braddock, Vice-Chair and C. Freeman McNeal, Member. Commission staff present included Ms. Georgetta Kelly, Civil Service Secretary, Ms. Nancy Olind, Assistant Human Resources Director, and Ms. Seeta Martindale, Recording Secretary.

### AGENDA ITEMS

**APPROVAL OF MINUTES FROM THE 12/04/2014 MEETING.** Minutes were previously routed and reviewed. Commissioner Braddock made a motion to approve the minutes. Commissioner Robinson seconded the motion, and the minutes were unanimously approved.

#### **APPOINTMENT TO THE CLASSIFIED SERVICE:**

**Eric Bullock to the position of Water Works Valve Operator 1 in the Department of Water.** This position was posted as an Open-Competitive exam. The staff recommended approval of this item as the candidate met the minimum requirements for the position, successfully passed the Water Works Valve Operator 1 exam, met the needs of the department, and was selected from among the candidates referred to the department. The Commission approved this item.

**Mary Scott to the position of Accounting Technician 3 in the Public Services Department.** This position was posted as an Open-Competitive exam. The staff recommended approval of this item as the candidate met the minimum requirements for the position, successfully passed the Accounting Technician 3 exam, met the needs of the department, and was selected from among the candidates referred to the department. The Commission approved this item.

#### **APPOINTMENT TO THE CLASSIFIED SERVICE: Non-Competitive**

**Amy Scarlato to the position of Nursing Supervisor in the Finance Department/Risk Management Division.** The staff recommended approval of this item as the candidate met the minimum qualifications for the position as outlined in the job posting, possesses the specific skills needed by the department, and was selected from among the qualifying candidates referred to the department. Based on the professional nature of the work, the Commission suspended the requirement for competition and approved the appointment.

**Amanda Carusone to the position of Laboratory Assistant in the Department of Sewers.** The staff recommended approval of this item as the candidate met the minimum qualifications for the position as outlined in the job posting, possesses the specific skills needed by the department, and was selected from among the qualifying candidates referred to the department. Based on the professional nature of the work, the requirement for competition was suspended by the Commission and the appointment was approved.

**Bruce Malcolm to the position of Parks/Recreation Maintenance Crew Leader (Grounds Maintenance) in the Parks Department.** The staff recommended approval of this item as the candidate met the minimum qualifications for the position as outlined in job posting, possesses the specific skills needed by the department, and was selected from among the qualifying candidates referred to the department. Based on the professional nature of the work, the requirement for competition was suspended by the Commission and the appointment was approved.

**Mark Brown was appointed to the position of Information Technology Coordinator in the City Manager's Office/Emergency Communications Center.** The staff recommended approval of this item as the candidate met the minimum qualifications for the position as outlined in job posting, possesses the specific skills needed by the department, and was selected from among the qualifying candidates referred to the department. Based on the professional nature of the work, the requirement for competition was suspended by the Commission and the appointment was approved.

**Patrick Dean and Danny Lawson to Plumber positions in the Public Services Department.** The staff recommended approval of this item as the candidates met the minimum qualifications for the position as outlined in job posting, possess the specific skills needed by the department, and were selected from among the qualifying candidates referred to the department. Based on the professional nature of the work, the requirement for competition was suspended by the Commission and the appointments were approved.

**Sarah Kington to the position of Dietitian in the Health Department.** The staff recommended approval of this item as the candidate met the minimum qualifications for the position as outlined in job posting, possesses the specific skills needed by the department, and was selected from among the qualifying candidates referred to the department. Based on the professional nature of the work, the requirement for competition was suspended by the Commission and the appointment was approved.

#### **NOTICE OF PERSONNEL ACTION: Promotion**

**Denise Burch to the position of Administrative Technician in the Parks Department.** This position was posted as a promotional examination. The candidate met the minimum qualifications for the position as outlined in the job posting and was selected, within the collective bargaining agreement, from among the passing candidates referred to the department. The Commission noted this item.

**Eric Coats, Douglas Kuhn, and Benjamin Kutcher to the position of Fire Apparatus Operator in the Fire Department.** This position was posted as a promotional examination. The candidates met the minimum qualifications for the position as outlined in the job posting and were selected, within the collective bargaining agreement, from among the passing candidates referred to the department. The Commission noted this item.

**Tytus Fillmore and Anthony Mitchell to the rank of Police Sergeant in the Police Department.** This position was posted as a promotional examination. The candidates met the minimum qualifications for the position as outlined in the job posting and were selected, within the collective bargaining agreement, from among the passing candidates referred to the department from the eligible list. The Commission noted this item.

**Tracy Russell to the position of Storekeeper in the Police Department.** This position was posted as a promotional examination. The candidate met the minimum qualifications for the position as outlined in the job posting and was selected, within the collective bargaining agreement, from among the passing candidates referred to the department from the eligible list. The Commission noted this item.

**Marcus Thomas to the position of Wastewater Collection Equipment Specialist in the Department of Water.** The candidate successfully passed the promotional exam, met the minimum requirements for the position, and was selected, within the collective bargaining agreement guidelines from among the candidates referred to the department. The Commission noted this item.

**MINUTES** cont'd...

**ORGANIZATION AND DUTIES: Voluntary Demotion**

**Keisha Chiles to the position of Emergency 9-1-1 Operator in the City Manager's Office, Emergency Communications Center Division.** The candidate met the minimum qualifications for the position, and all parties concerned have agreed to the voluntary demotion. The Commission approved this item.

**Matt Pies from a Police Officer in the Police Department to an Operator and Dispatcher in the City Manager's Office/Emergency Communications Center.** The candidate met the minimum qualifications for the position, and all parties concerned agreed to the voluntary demotion. The Commission approved this item.

**Julian Robinson to the position of Wastewater Collection Equipment Specialist (WCES).** The candidate met the minimum qualifications for the position, and all parties concerned have agreed to the voluntary demotion. The Commission approved this item.

**NOTICE OF PERSONNEL ACTION: Transfer**

**Tiphane Galvez to the position of Administrative Specialist in the Police Department.** The Cincinnati Police Department is providing notice of the transfer of the candidate, as part of settlement agreement with the City of Cincinnati and the CODE Collective Bargaining Unit, to the position of Administrative Specialist in the Personnel Section of the Police Department. The Commission noted this item.

**NOTICE OF PERSONNEL ACTION: Re-instatement**

**Re-instatement of Barbara Boylan to the position of Senior Administrative Specialist in the Department of Sewers.** Pursuant to Civil Service Rule 8, Section 4, the candidate is eligible to return to City Service to the position of Senior Administrative Specialist, as she resigned in good standing on March 2014. The Commission approved this item.

**NOTICE OF PERSONNEL ACTION: Working out of Class**

**Gloria Williams to the position of Employment and Training Supervisor in the Department of Sewers.** Due to the retirement of the incumbent, the candidate was selected, within the guidelines of the CODE Bargaining Unit, for temporary assignment to work out of class in the position of Training Supervisor. The candidate met the qualifications of this position and is the only employee in the employing unit who possesses the specific skills and required experience to fulfill the current needs of the department. The Commission noted this item.

**ORGANIZATION AND DUTIES: Request for Approval of Exam Schedules**

- a) Police Officer-Lateral Entry Structured Oral Interviews
- b) Water Works Maintenance Field Supervisor

The Commission approved these items.

**ORGANIZATION AND DUTIES: Request for Approval of Special Examiners**

- c) Steve Predmore, Rico Cosby, Ken Bollinger, and Brent Camp for the Water Works Maintenance Crew Leader exam

**MINUTES cont'd...**

- d) Randy Schneider, Donny Smith and Eric Withers for the Wastewater Collection Inspector exam
- e) Leslie Ostronzny for the Water Works Maintenance Field Supervisor exam
- f) Mike Pittinger and Kathy Rahtz for the Wastewater Collection Supervisor Structured Oral exam

The staff recommended approval of the special examiners. The Commission approved these items.

**ORGANIZATION AND DUTIES: Police Recruit Selection/Disqualification Criteria**

**Request from Staff to approve the revision to the Selection/Disqualification Criteria for the Police Recruit-Tattoos.** A revised draft of the Police Recruit Selection/Disqualification Criteria was presented to the Commission. This item was approved with edits by the Commission.

**ELIGIBLE LISTS: Request for Approval**

- a) Health Clinic Coordinator
- b) Water Works Maintenance Worker

The staff provided information pertaining to the eligible lists and recommended approval. The Commission approved these items and the lists will be posted on the City's Website following exam Review, as needed.

**CLASSIFICATION: Request for the approval of new and/or revised classification specifications:**

- a) Development Officer 4 (Economic Development)
- b) Parks/Recreation Programming Coordinator (Aquatics)
- c) Plant Supervisor (Water Treatment)
- d) Senior Community Development & Planning Analyst (Compliance)
- e) Service Area Coordinator (Recreation Indoor Facility/Maintenance)
- f) Treatment Supervisor (MSD – Division of Industrial Waste)
- g) Carpenter

The staff recommended approval of the new/revised classification specifications. These classification specifications were approved by the Commission.

**CLASSIFICATION: Request from Departments to add/delete positions to their table of organization:**

- a) **Health Department:** Add (1) Reproduction Machine Operator 3 and delete (1) Reproduction Machine Operator 2
- b) **Recreation Department:** Add (1) Service Area Coordinator (Recreation Indoor/Facility Maintenance). Delete (1) Facility Maintenance Specialist and (1) Laborer

**MINUTES cont'd...**

- c) **Department of Sewers:** Add (2) Senior Computer Programmer Analysts. Delete (2) Computer Programmer Analysts
- d) **Department of Water:** Add (1) Treatment Superintendent. Delete (1) Water Distribution Superintendent

The staff supported its recommendations for approval of the add/delete positions by presenting budget and organizational information relating to each item and the items were approved.

**CLASSIFICATION: Classification Study**

**Barbara Kendrick request for review of classification-Board of Education.** Ms. Kendrick was present at the meeting to address the results of the classification study of her position as a Senior Support Specialist, which was conducted by the Human Resources Department at the Board of Education. There was no representative from the Board of Education at the meeting. Ms. Kendrick offered added details regarding the scope of duties she performs; outlining the measure of responsibility and accountability associated with her duties as evidence as to why she should be promoted. The Commission tabled this item for further review.

**Request from Health Department for study of RMO2 position to include a request for promotion without exam of Renee Davis-Ingersol, if study is approved, and update the Table of Organization to add a RMO3 and delete a RMO2.** A job classification study to upgrade the position of Reproduction Machine Operator 2 (RMO2) to a RMO3 was presented to the Commission as the Health Department has acquired new equipment that warrants the upgrade and the duties performed are within the job classification level of a RMO3. As there is no current eligible list for the RMO3 position, the incumbent, Ms. Davis-Ingersol, who is the only qualified and interested candidate in the employing unit, was selected for promotion to the reclassified position as meeting the current needs of the department. The Commission approved the classification study and the promotion of the incumbent to the position of RMO3.

**APPEAL TO THE COMMISSION: Information Items:**

**Appeal Hearing Schedule:**

Name	Scheduled for:
David Johnson	Scheduled for January 29, 2015
Phillip Jones	Continuance Requested to seek Representation
Robert DeBonis	Appellant awaiting delivery of Subpoenaed documents/ Scheduling Suspended
Daryl Ross	On Hold/Law Dept. to provide on-going updates

The staff provided information on the current Appeal Hearing Schedule. The Commission noted this item and requested follow-up regarding the hearing schedule.

**Request from Richard Johnson for an appeal hearing date regarding his medical separation from the Department of Water.** The candidate was not present at the meeting. The Commission heard the request and granted an appeal hearing date to be scheduled by Civil Service staff and communicated to all parties concerned. Notice of a hearing date will be provided.

**APPLICATION FOR ENTRANCE EXAM:**

**Request from Amanda Reyes for an alternate exam date for the Police Recruit (Open) Physical Ability Test.** The candidate was not present at the meeting. Commission staff provided information submitted by the applicant pertaining to the request. The Commission tabled the request for further consideration.

**Request from Corey Jutte for an alternate exam date for the Police Recruit (Open) Physical Ability Test.** The candidate was not present at the meeting. Commission staff provided information submitted by the applicant pertaining to the request. The Commission denied the request.

**Request from David Dill for an alternate exam date for the Police Recruit (Open) Physical Ability Test.** The candidate was not present at the meeting. Commission staff provided information submitted by the applicant pertaining to the request. The Commission denied the request.

**Request from David Hayes for an alternate exam date for the Police Recruit (Open) Physical Ability Test.** The candidate was not present at the meeting. Commission staff provided information submitted by the applicant pertaining to the request. The Commission denied the request.

**Request from Elijah Ladipo for an alternate exam date for the Police Recruit (Open) Physical Ability Test.** The candidate was not present at the meeting. Commission staff provided information submitted by the applicant pertaining to the request. The Commission denied the request.

**Request from Justin Lake for an alternate exam date for the Police Recruit (Open) Physical Ability Test.** The candidate was present at the meeting to offer additional information relating to his request for an accommodation for the Police Recruit Physical Ability Testing process. Ms. Alexandria White, Senior Human Resources Analyst with the City's Human Resources Department, was also present. The Commission approved the request to allow Mr. Lake to continue in the exam process for Police Recruit.

**Request from Corey Corbin to appeal the rejection of his application for the Water Works Maintenance Worker (Article 20) exam.** The candidate was present at the meeting and spoke on the subject of expanding the feeder classification list for the Water Works Maintenance Worker (Article 20) exam to include his present job classification of Water Works Customer Representative 1. Mr. Corbin explained his perception that his present position is equivalent to a Valve Operator 1, which is one of the acceptable feeder positions for this exam. The Commission denied the request.

**Request from Staff to evaluate and determine next steps for a Police Recruit candidate regarding conduct issues.** The City's Human Resources Department requested that the Commission review information supplied by a concerned citizen on matters relating to a Civil Service applicant along with a legal opinion and provide direction on next steps. The Commission tabled this item pending further review on the subject.

**ORGANIZATION AND DUTIES: Request to Speak Before the Commission**

**Request from Cheryl Twitty-Choate to speak before the Commission regarding Service Area Coordinator (Quality Assurance/compliance).** Ms Twitty-Choate was present at the meeting to speak about her position on the current Service Area Coordinator eligible list and not having the opportunity for promotion. Ms. Twitty-Choate expressed disagreement with the amended classification of Service Area Coordinator (Quality Assurance/Compliance). The Commission heard her comments and noted her concerns.

**ADDITIONAL INFORMATION:**

**The legal representatives of the Cincinnati Organization of Dedicated Employees (CODE) Bargaining Unit have requested to address each item on the agenda per Civil Service Rule 2, Section 5.** CODE representatives were not present at the meeting. The Commission noted all items as waived.

**The Commission has received a letter from CODE dated December 10, 2014, regarding an appointment in the ETS Department.** CODE had previously spoken on the same matter at the Commission meeting on December 4, 2014. The Commission has taken the matter under advisement and will issue a determination on the matter.

- ***Close - Public Meeting reconvened***